

Town of Barnstable
Old King's Highway Historic District
MINUTES
Wednesday, November 10, 2010

To all persons deemed interested or affected by the Town of Barnstable's Old King's Highway Historic District Act under Section 9 of Chapter 470, Acts of 1973 as amended. You are hereby notified that a hearing was held on the following application:

Committee Members Present: Patricia Anderson, Carrie Bearse, Elizabeth Nilsson and George Jessop

Motion duly made Pat Anderson, seconded by Carrie Bearse, that George Jessop be appointed Temporary Chair for this Evening.

AYE: ALL

NAY: None

So Voted Unanimously

A quorum being met, Temporary Chair Jessop called the hearing to order at 7:00pm. The Chair explained the hearing and appeal process and invited the public to address the Committee and view the plans of interest.

Continued Applications

Presbyterian Church, 2391 Iyannough Road, W. Barnstable, Map 216, Parcel 045

Install Door Canopy over Rear Entrance

(Continued from October 27, 2010 for Rear Canopy)

Represented by John Chapman

Mr. Chapman explained that the question at the last meeting was if wooden brackets could be incorporated into the overhand. The suggested bracket would work if he could shrink the size and instead of a 4 foot projection, he would like to go with 3 feet. George Jessop commented that he believes this would be appropriate and asked if the brackets would be custom-made and Mr. Chapman indicated that they would be and intends to utilize pressure treated 4 x 4 foot posts and legs 3 to 3 ½ feet wide. He would rather keep square and not have an arch. Mr. Chapman also wished to confirm that at the last meeting when the issue of moving the sign came up, it was suggested by this Board to simply move it to the other side of the driveway and this is something they would like to contemplate. It was agreed by the Members that this was suggested.

Motion duly made by Pat Anderson, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Canopy as Modified with wooden brackets over rear entrance.

So Voted Unanimously

Kinlin, Robert, 3256 Main Street, Barnstable, Map 299, Parcel 033

Handicap Ramp at Rear

(Continued from October 27, 2010 for Handicap Ramp)

No Representation present and request for Continuance was sought.

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Continue the Handicap Ramp portion of this Certificate of Appropriateness to December 8, 2010.

So Voted Unanimously

New Applications

Hicks, Marilyn, 83 Goodview Way, Barnstable, Map 319, Parcel 083

Deconstruct 1 Car Garage & Breezeway, Rebuild Breezeway & 2 Car Garage

Represented by Sturgis St. Peter

Mr. St Peter detailed the plans to deconstruct a 1 car garage and breezeway and rebuild a new breezeway and 2 car garage. Carrie Bearse asked if there were windows or screens in the new breezeway and Mr. St Peter commented that they will be windows that compliment the 8/8 pattern in the main house and would have exterior applied grills. George Jessop asks if these windows would be the same in the dormer and it was confirmed. Elizabeth Nilsson commented on the shutters on the rear of the garage and Mr. St Peter noted that there will be two on each side of the windows. Pat Anderson wished to know the materials of the cantilevered deck and Mr. St Peter stated that it will be pressure treated wood with a mahogany decking. Mr. St Peter noted that the homeowners would like to add a window to the northeast dormer to allow for a view. A discussion on the size and

positioning of the windows was had. It was determined that a small regular window positioned as the others would be appropriate.

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Marilyn Hicks at 83 Goodview Way, Barnstable as submitted with the addition of a small regular window positioned as other windows on the northeast dormer.

So Voted Unanimously

Schilpp, Frederick/Pickman, Carolyn, 115 Rendezvous Lane, Barnstable, Map 279, Parcel 029

New Screened Gazebo, Greenhouse, 2 Shed Dormers, 2 Enlarged Double Hung Windows

Represented by Keith Mackenzie-Betty

Mr. Mackenzie-Betty reviewed the photographs of the existing house that were included in the application with the Board and indicated the section that fronts Rendezvous Lane. The windows will be enlarged slightly and two shed dormers added. Carrie Bearse commented that her initial reaction and that was confirmed by a site visit was that the proposed renovations were most inappropriate given the age of the house. She was taken aback as to how it changes this charming antique home. She would personally not be in favor of the gazebo portion of the design.

Chair Jessop asked anyone interested parties in the audience to come forward and a few individuals approached and reviewed the design. Chair Jessop then commented that on this style of house, if there were to be a second floor you would expect to see a dog house dormer and two windows and asked if they had considered wall dormers. Mr. Mackenzie-Betty stated that they had looked at a lot of options and this is the one the homeowners wanted, but added that it should not be a problem to change from the shed dormer to a doghouse dormer.

Pat Anderson commented that she does not agree that the gazebo and the screened greenhouse should be right up next to the original portion of the house. These are usually structures that are separate from the house. The gazebo, the greenhouse and the decking all across the front are going to change the whole front façade. Mr. Mackenzie-Betty asked if there was to be a three season screened porch on this house, would the Board agree to the front. It was the consensus that this should be at the rear. Mr. Mackenzie-Betty noted that the gazebo was positioned to take advantage of the view to the bay. Pat Anderson commented that this is not what she would consider a gazebo, this is a room and she understands why they want the structure where they do, but it is wrong for this house.

George Jessop confirmed that the property has a detached garage and he would suggest a drawing that included the garage so that they could visualize the effect that gazebo has on the overall property. Carrie Bearse stated that this house was built in 1750 and unfortunately, the Inventory for this property is not available at tonight's meeting, but this is a simple home, beautifully sited on the lot and one of the few that remains.

Elizabeth Nilsson commented that she would have a hard time approving the greenhouse and asked what materials would be used. Mr. Mackenzie-Betty noted that it would be wood and fabric and Pat Anderson asked if there could be some way to break up the length as that would be a lot of fabric.

The Members and the representative confirmed the issues of concern and Mr. Mackenzie-Betty requested a continuance to confer with the homeowners.

Motion duly made by Pat Anderson, seconded by Carrie Bearse to Continue the Certificate of Appropriateness for Schilpp, Frederick/Pickman, Carolyn, at 115 Rendezvous Lane, Barnstable, until December 8, 2010.

Silverman, Rhonda & Stephen, 0 Rue Michele, Barnstable, Map 335, Parcel 067

Construct Single Family Home w/Family Apartment & Attached Garage

Represented Rhonda & Stephen Silverman, Tim Luft, Architect
& Elaine Johnson, Landscape Consultant

Mr. Luft noted for the Members that this parcel is part of a small subdivision that was developed and currently is a vacant lot. They are proposing to build a new farmhouse style house with attached family apartment and garage. Pat Anderson asked with the material will be for the columns and Mr. Luft indicated they would be fiberglass. Windows are 2/2 with simulated divided light Andersen Series A.

George Jessop asked why they did not carry the porch around to the side on the left elevation as it is in the right elevation. Mr. Luft explained that there were a few houses that they saw that had a small recessed porch on the side and they used this as an inspiration rather than wrapping it all the way around.

Clapboard is proposed for the front and pre-dipped shingles on the sides and back. Elizabeth Nilsson asked the material for the porch and it is proposed for Ipe which is a wood product that weathers to a natural grey. The roofing is certain teed architectural shingles in weathered wood.

Carrie Bearse commented that the landscaping plan looks appropriate and very detailed. George Jessop commented that he likes that the garage doors are on the side and that the choice of materials are excellent and the prepainted shingles for the siding will give the house a uniformed look. He would suggest jutting the rake to match the overhang eave projection and suggests a chimney pot on the chimney (a sample of which the Committee would like to see).

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Silverman, Rhonda & Stephen at 0 Rue Michele, Barnstable as Submitted and with Recommendations.

So Voted Unanimously

Plikaitis, Robert & William, 2355 Iyannough Road, Barnstable, Map 216, Parcel 044

Repair Corner Boards & Rake Tips, Change Color on House & Garage, Re-Roof

Represented by William Plikaitis

Mr. Plikaitis explained that other than the change of paint color, the majority of the work is maintenance. George Jessop asked if they were experiencing water damage on the corner board and rakes and, if so, there is a product out there that is a clear liquid that will fill up the holes so that water does not penetrate. Carrie Bearse confirmed that the color change is to a cottage red and that the roof will be a weathered wood.

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Nilsson, seconded by Carrie Bearse to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Robert & William Plikaitis at 2355 Iyannough Road, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

Nolan, Robert & Judith, 200 Mill Way, Barnstable, Map 300, Parcel 035

Demolish Two Small Additions

Represented by Robert & Judith Nolan and Architect Ken Sadler

Mr. Sadler stated that the additions were done in 1942 and the dormer was added in 1974 and for whatever reason, the height between the doorways on the additions is extremely low. They have looked for salvageable materials, but there are none. The new additions will not affect the main house except where it will connect at the corner elevation. The view from Mill Way will have the same footprint.

Motion duly made by Elizabeth Nilsson, seconded by Carrie Bearse to Approve the Certificate of Demolition for Robert & Judith Nolan for 200 Mill Way, Barnstable as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

Nolan, Robert & Judith, 200 Mill Way, Barnstable, Map 300, Parcel 035

Construct New Garage, Kitchen & Bedroom

Represented by Robert & Judith Nolan and Architect Ken Sadler

The site plan was reviewed and Mr. Sadler again, reiterated that the footprint will not change the view from Mill Way. The original windows have 2/2 and the old dormer added in 1974 has 6/6. They intent to match all new windows with the 2/2 pattern, including the dormer window. Carrie Bearse voiced concern that the doghouse dormer was higher than the original structure that is the home. Mr. Sadler confirmed it is approximately 6-8" higher, mostly due to new building codes and added that you will really not be able to notice it as it is set back from the gable end. Pat Anderson asked if there was any way to lower the dormer and commented that it appears to be higher than the 6-8" stated and she would insist, should this be approved, that the height is no more than 1 foot higher. Mr. Sadler said he would be happy to keep the roof pitch of the dormer to 1 foot or less.

Carrie Bearse asked about the garage and if they will be blocked by the Barn. Mr. Sadler indicated that most of the view of the doors would be blocked by the Barn. Carrie Bearse voiced concern on the fiberglass doors and added that they may want to investigate something else as they are doing such a wonderful job of restoration. The Nolan's indicated that they actually would prefer wooden doors that compliment the barn doors.

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Pat Anderson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Robert & Judith Nolan at 200 Mill Way, Barnstable as Stipulated that the new addition be no higher than 12" to the existing house and if so desired to substitute wood garage doors.

So Voted Unanimously

Watson-Baker, Lucy, 26 Hanson Lane, W. Barnstable, Map 316, Parcel 092

Installation of 25 Solar Photovoltaic Panels on Southern Roof

Represented by Lucy Watson-Baker and Herb Rice, Cotuit Solar

A Letter of Support from Jan Rapp of the Town of Barnstable Renewable Energy Commission was read into the record by Chair Jessop (Exhibit 1)

Mr. Rice explained that there will be 25 panels that measure 37.5 x 65.5 inches each on the south facing portion of the roof. George Jessop inquired if there was a reason why they have started the panels over the front door rather than from the far right as he believes it would look better if they were centered. Pat Anderson stated that, notwithstanding the recent appeal to the Regional Board that was overturned, she would still be opposed to putting solar panels on the front elevation of any home as she believes this is inappropriate. Ms. Anderson also stated she understands why the applicants want to place them on the front elevation as this is the elevation that faces south, but that it will be within the public view.

A detailed discussion between the members took place as to setting precedence. Carrie Bearse stated that this neighborhood is off the beaten path and does agree with Ms. Anderson that solar panels, in most cases, are not appropriate for the front elevation. However, in this instance, it is fine in her opinion. Pat Anderson clarified that her position has to do with consistency. George Jessop commented that you may be setting precedence if you approve for one south facing house, you may have to approve for all and one day you may have a really historic house requesting solar panels on the front of their house that faces 6A. Mr. Jessop went on to state that this house is not of a historic design and that this street accesses a dead end. However, the task before this Committee is do they try to set a precedence by standing to the position of not approving solar panels on front elevations and have Regional keep overturning them or do they try to set forth reasonable standards themselves. Elizabeth Nilsson believes this Board should keep to the position of not approving solar panels on front elevations because if they approve one, they will have to consistently approve requests such as this.

George Jessop believes that this Board should set the standard. He does not believe solar energy should be applied to every house, but the qualities and standards of the house should dictate. Pat Anderson noted that the Court does not recognize setting, they only recognize precedent. Carrie Bearse stated that this Committee is charged to review each application on a case by case basis. She could not imagine the Regional Board overturning them on a denial for solar panels on a historic home on 6A. Ms. Bearse believes the reason they were overturned in a previous Appeal was due to the setting and she believes that setting can be applied to this application. George Jessop confirmed that the two houses on Palomino Drive and the other two on Hanson are the only neighbors who would drive past this residence.

Chair Jessop stated that before the Board are two positions; one is that if they approve front facing solar panels that they will have to approve all future requests or two, because the house sits in a fairly new development and is not historic and is hidden from view from the general public that it should be approved.

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Lucy Watson-Baker at 26 Hanson Lane, W. Barnstable for 25 Solar Photovoltaic Panels on Southern Roof with panels positioned beginning at the far right of the house.

VOTE:

AYE: Bearse, Jessop

NAY: Anderson, Nilsson

The Vote is tied at 2-2 and therefore the Motion does not Carry

Holland, Joseph & Michelle, 24 George Street, Barnstable, Map 319, Parcel 078

Demolition of Detached Garage

Represented by Joseph Holland and Shane Wood

The Certificate of Demolition application was reviewed and deemed appropriate for demolition.

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Demolition as Submitted.

So Voted Unanimously

Holland, Joseph & Michelle, 24 George Street, Barnstable, Map 319, Parcel 078

Construct Attached Garage, Addition, Front Dormers, Covered Porch, Deck

Represented by Joseph Holland and Shane Wood

Mr. Wood stated that they would like to build an attached garage onto the existing mudroom. They are proposing to rebuild the mudroom to make it deeper, add a dining room and a bump out. Carrie Bearse asked if the attached garage will be higher than the house. Mr. Wood explained that they are working on if they want the house to be higher and Carrie Bearse noted that this was not part of the application and if they intend to raise the height of the house a new application would need to be filed. Pat Anderson asked the square footage of the house as it exists today and was informed approximately 1500 square feet and will increase approximately 300

more square feet. Ms. Anderson, in reviewing the checklist, noted that the new square footage is indicated as 3200 square feet.

Carrie Bearse wished to address the drawings and in particular the front elevation as a few items seem inappropriate. One item is the angle of the roof and to have something sticking up higher than the chimney is a problem for her, as well as the angle of the garage. Mr. Wood explained that they turned the garage in the other direction because when they had it face the street it seemed that there was too much roof line and needed to be broken up. George Jessop stated that he does not like a garage facing the front elevation and asked if it needed to be attached to the house. Mr. Wood explained that was the original scheme, but by the time you put the 2 car garage and a breezeway you would have a pinch point between the two. Pat Anderson commented that they are adding a huge amount to an existing small house. Applicant noted that this is one of the biggest lots on the street and Pat Anderson added that this addition makes it almost three times larger than what is there now.

George Jessop commented on the columns on the covered porch and that they are much heavier than normal for this neighborhood and would suggest that a 6x6 square post is more adequate than the Greek columns proposed. Mr. Jessop also noted that the Nantucket dormer with double doghouse dormers and shed dormer between is not typical of this style of home. He would rather see one or the other than this combination.

Carrie Bearse questions the height on addition as it appears to be significantly higher than the house, but not on the front elevation. She commented that she would be opposed to the garage height being higher than the house and the cupola or guard tower they propose is way out of scale for the house. Carrie Bearse also questioned if they would have to remove the three trees that are now in front of the existing garage and was informed that they would need to be removed. Carrie Bearse stated that then this needs to be on the application as well.

Chair Jessop summed up the concerns of the Members which include the suggestion to review the concept of a detached garage with guest cottage atop, the present proposal needs to be scaled down, the cupola, the height of the garage in conjunction with the existing house, and the porch which members believe is too dramatic and inappropriate. Carrie Bearse commented that, for her, the three season room off the back of the house is fine and scaled.

Motion duly made by Pat Anderson, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Continue the Certificate of Appropriateness for Holland, Joseph & Michelle at 24 George Street, Barnstable to December 08, 2010. So Voted Unanimously

NOTE: Pat Anderson recuses herself from the remainder of the Meeting.

Sunderland, Marc & Priscilla, 66 Maraspin Road, Barnstable, Map 299, Parcel 077

Construct 12' x 12' Addition

Represented by Marc Sunderland

Mr. Sunderland detailed the proposed addition and the intent to match existing roof ridge, Andersen windows, siding and trim. Carrie Bearse commented that the addition is very appropriate.

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for Marc & Priscilla Sunderland at 66 Maraspin Road, Barnstable as Submitted. So Voted Unanimously

Minor Modifications

Carlson, Carl, 275 Old Jail Lane, Barnstable, Map 277, Parcel 020-001

Substitute Black Ornamental Aluminum/Steel Fence for Approved Black Chain Link Fence

Motion duly made by Carrie Bearse, seconded by Elizabeth Nilsson to Approve the Minor Modification for Carl Carlson at 275 Old Jail Lane, Barnstable for substitution of black ornamental aluminum/steel fence in place of approved black chain link fence.

So Voted Unanimously

Having no further business before this Committee, a Motion was duly made by Elizabeth Nilsson, seconded by Carrie Bearse to Adjourn the Meeting at 9:26pm.

So Voted Unanimously

Respectfully submitted,
Marylou Fair, Recording Secretary