

APPROVED MINUTES

2018 MAR 27 am11:54

**Barnstable Historical Commission
Barnstable Town Hall, 367 Main Street, Hyannis
Selectmen's Conference Room
February 20, 2018**

2018 MAR 27 am11:54

| | |
|--|--------------------------|
| Laurie Young, Chair | Absent |
| Nancy Clark, Vice Chair | Present |
| Marilyn Fifield, Clerk | Present |
| Nancy Shoemaker | Absent |
| George Jessop | Present <i>at 4:08pm</i> |
| Elizabeth Mumford | Present |
| Cheryl Powell | Present |
| Jessica Rapp Grassetti, Town Council Liaison | Absent |

Vice Chair **Nancy Clark** called the meeting to order at **4:01 pm**

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

APPLICATIONS

Estate of Ruth Plimpton; Plimpton, David, Anne, Thomas, Edward, Trustees, 979 Sea View Avenue, Osterville, Map 090, Parcel 008 - Full Demolition (Exhibit A)

Members sitting on this application – Nancy Clark, Marilyn Fifield, Elizabeth Mumford, Cheryl Powell

Represented by: Peggy Rowland (Applicant Representative)

Abutters/Public Comment: None present

Peggy Rowland said the applicant is seeking approval to demolish the structure, as it is on the market and most potential buyers would prefer to rebuild, although the homeowners would prefer to keep it as is.

Erin Logan explained that a demolition delay could be in effect for 24 months, with a six-month period for the applicant to pull a building permit after the eighteen-month delay.

MOTION 1:

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, that, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 979 Sea View Avenue, Osterville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

VOTE: Aye, unanimous

IF MOTION 1 PASSES (AYE VOTE):

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(G), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the full demolition of the Preferably-preserved Significant Building located at 979 Sea View Avenue, Osterville, is detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

George Jessop arrived at 4:08pm. Commissioners sitting on the remainder of the agenda were, Nancy Clark, Marilyn Fifield, George Jessop, Elizabeth Mumford & Cheryl Powell.

190 Bridge Street LLC, 190 Bridge Street, Osterville, Map 093, Parcel 028 - Full Demolition (Exhibit B)

Represented by: David Lawler, Attorney for the owner

Abutters/Public Comment: Bob Frazee

Attorney Lawler noted that this is not a listed property, as he distributed photos indicating that the home was rebuilt in 1992, along with countless renovations to the structure. He felt that the year built is an error in the Assessor's records, and he said the owner seeks to replace this non-historic building with a building of historic use, a wooden boat building with exterior of wood.

Bob Frazee said he lived across the street from the property, and he does not believe it is a historic building, does not doubt what Mr. Lawler presented, and has no reservations about this project.

MOTION 1:

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by George Jessop, that, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and associated materials, the Significant Building at 190 Bridge Street, Osterville, is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

VOTE: Nay, Unanimous

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

Cheryl Powell moved, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(G), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the full demolition of the Preferably-preserved Significant Building located at 190 Bridge Street, Osterville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town

VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

MSSI 31 Dale Ave. Property Group, Mark S. Scott, 31 Dale Avenue, Hyannis Port, Map 286, Parcel 030, Built c.1935, Contributing Building in a National Register Historic District - (Exhibit C)

Partial Demolition - Revised plans to include, replacing windows and siding, adding dormer on garage, adding two balconies on water side, elevating house to be above flood zone, adding second floor over first-floor sunroom, with no footprint changes

Represented by: Andy Hinterman & Doug Dick of LDA Architecture; John Kenney, Attorney; Jack Delaney, J.J.

Delaney Inc. Builder

Abutters/Public Comment: None present

Attorney Kenney explained that this property needs significant repair and upgrading, and Andy Hinterman detailed the project, including replacing all of the windows in the 1935 house, noting that some of the windows had been moved. He said portions of the foundation do not conform to the building code, and the building is below the FEMA flood level, so elevating the building is proposed to rebuild the entire foundation with proper flood vents to increase its longevity. He said that a new dormer would be added at the rear of the garage, a new entry cover would be added on the street side of the house, and a second story would be added, with no footprint change to the garage and no demolition of the chimneys. Mr. Hinterman said he'd met with Sarah Korjeff of the Cape Cod Commission, and she suggested reducing the rear dormer, so he'd attempted to reshape the dormer to look less obtrusive, repeating that the footprint would remain unchanged.

Nancy Clark confirmed that the chimneys would remain intact, since the original proposal sought to remove them.

Jack Delaney explained that Sarah Korjeff suggested reducing the rafters, so that reduced the dormer size a bit.

In reply to Elizabeth Mumford's inquiry regarding the structure's height, he said the second story will be raised an additional foot, and the ridge will be four feet higher.

He also noted that Conservation Commission approval is still needed.

Cheryl Powell asked if the change in the dormer will make a difference if the house is being raised, and she also inquired about the covering on the terrace.

Mr. Hinterman replied that the covered terrace is no longer part of the proposal, and he designed the dormers to minimize their impact.

In reply to Elizabeth Mumford's question about the second-story addition on the sunporch, Doug Dick pointed out how the roofline would blend.

George Jessop asked why a balcony is needed on the ocean, and Hinterman replied that the sill of the window is high, so the view is obstructed.

Mr. Jessop then asked how the HVAC unit would be camouflaged so the neighbors would not have to look at it, suggesting a fence or enclosure.

Mr. Delaney replied that it's not visible above the slope of the land. Mr. Hinterman added that the equipment would remain at grade, but the property grade goes up on the east side, and there is no structure immediately adjacent, plus a great deal of landscaping is planned.

Nancy Clark reported that the Commission had just received a letter from an abutter named Hutchins, in support of the project, in addition to the abutter letters previously received, and she read the new letter of support into the record.

In concluding discussion, with no other comments from the public, Mr. Jessop noted how nice it was to see this structure rehabbed rather than replaced.

MOTION TO AMEND

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded by George Jessop, that the Barnstable Historical Commission amend its decision dated January 22, 2018, based on the submission of revised plans entitled, "Amended Detail of Demolition Proposed, dated February 12, 2018."

VOTE: Aye, Unanimous

MOTION 1: Referral to the Cape Cod Commission¹

Elizabeth Mumford moved and George Jessop seconded that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds and determines that, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for **31 Dale Avenue, Hyannis Port:**

- The property is outside a local historic district;
- The property is a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District
- The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;

The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

VOTE: Nay, Unanimous

¹ Initial vote required to determine the applicability of Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Threshold pursuant to Cape Cod Commission Act Section 12 (c) (1) and CCC Enabling Regulations Governing the Review of Developments of Regional Impacts Chapter A, Section 2(a) (i)(a)

MOTION 2: Partial Demolition of Building

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded by George Jessop, that the Barnstable Historical Commission find, after review and consideration of public testimony, the application, and record file for the partial demolition proposed at 31 Dale Avenue, Hyannis Port, that this Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved Significant Building.

AYE: 1 (Cheryl Powell)

NAY: 4

VOTE: Failed with 4 Nay, 1 Aye

IF MOTION 1 FAILS (NAY VOTE):

Elizabeth Mumford moved, seconded by George Jessop, that, in accordance with Section 112-3(F), the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 31 Dale Avenue, Hyannis Port, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

An AYE vote determines that the partial demolition IS NOT detrimental - no demolition delay imposed

AYE: 4

NAY: 0

ABSTAIN: 1 (Cheryl Powell)

VOTE: Carried with 4 Aye; 0 Nay; 1 Abstaining

Sprinkle, Brad, 3600 Falmouth Road, Marstons Mills, Map 077, Parcel 005, Charles Marston Homestead, Built c.1821, Inventoried - Full Demolition of two structures - (Exhibit D)

Represented by: Brad Sprinkle, Janet Milkman of Barnstable Land Trust (potential buyer)

Abutters/Public Comment: David Martin, President, Marstons Mills Historical Society; Bob Frazee, Jim Gould

Brad Sprinkle said he has owned the property since 2006, and it is a non-conforming lot. He said the Barnstable Land Trust is interested in the land, but without the structures on the property, as they want to create walking paths. In describing the structures' condition, he noted their vinyl siding and linoleum floors.

Janet Milkman of the Barnstable Land Trust felt this lot is an important property for conservation purposes as a gateway to Marstons Mills Village, on the pond and near the herring run. She said the Barnstable Land Trust would prefer the structures be removed, although they would consider a plaque or some kind of reference to them after their removal.

Nancy Clark asked if they have thought of using the larger building as meeting space, or for public rest rooms, etc., and Ms. Milkman replied that BLT would not have the finances to support a structure.

Jim Gould noted that the house is nearly 200 years old and that he had been in the house some years ago. He detailed its history, saying Charles Marston was a prominent citizen of the town of Barnstable, as a Senator with a major role in the improvement of the village. The house was later passed on to the Perry family, with training on the site for professional boxing, and Mr. Gould felt the building is worth preserving.

David Martin asked the Commission for a delay to give the opportunity for a supervised inspection.

Bob Frazee also asked that historic properties receive full due process with an independent structural review to better document the structures themselves, especially if they are to be demolished, calling proper architectural documentation important.

Mr. Sprinkle reported that experience with intruders going into the building had led to his attorney's advice that he post "no trespassing" signs, repeating that the house has vinyl siding, storm windows, modern plumbing, and has been modified in the 1970s or thereafter.

George Jessop noted that the original structure may survive beneath the vinyl, adding that it is not indicative of the true condition of the building, and the structure should be inspected.

Nancy Clark preferred to continue review of this application so that perhaps Nancy Shoemaker and George Jessop and possibly others could go and look at the structure, pending approval from the homeowner.

Marilyn Fifield wondered if funds for a professional structural evaluation could be available through the Community Preservation Committee.

George Jessop said that Bob Hayden would be able to advise if the structures could be moved, perhaps without the additions.

Vice Chair Clark asked Mr. Sprinkle if he would like to ask for a continuance, and he agreed to continue review of this application and also to seek approval from his attorney for inspection of the historic homestead.

Review of this application was then continued to the Commission's March 20, 2018, hearing.

OTHER

Tales of Cape Cod - The Commission agreed to send a letter in support of the State grant application of Tales of Cape Cod. (February 20, 2018, letter of support for Tales of Cape Cod's Mass. Preservation Projects Fund grant application - Exhibit E).

OTHER

Vice Chair Clark noted recent news of the Hyannis Armory, and Marilyn Fifield referred to the Town Manager's report on it at the February 15 Town Council meeting, suggesting the Commission write to offer to consult on planning for the historic building's future. Commissioners accepted Ms. Fifield's offer to draft such a letter on behalf of the Commission.

Elizabeth Mumford reported on the Cape Cod Commission's February 8 roundtable discussion that she and Ms. Fifield had attended, saying that many Cape historical commissioners agreed that a demolition delay is not adequate. She also noted that Chatham representatives felt their preservation awards seem to have helped in the preservation effort, and she reminded of another County workshop coming up in March. Vice Chair Clark asked that the agenda for the next meeting include discussion of preservation awards.

Ms. Mumford then shared the draft of her new coloring book of historic sites in Barnstable Village.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Marilyn Fifield moved, seconded by Cheryl Powell, to approve the January 16, 2018, minutes (Exhibit F), as edited.

Vote: Aye, unanimous

Next meetings: March 20, 2018 & April 17, 2018

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Cheryl Powell, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, to adjourn the meeting at **5:38pm.**

Respectfully Submitted,
Erin K. Logan, Recording Secretary
and Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield

| | | |
|-----------|------------------------------|----------------|
| Exhibit A | Notice of Intent to Demolish | 090 008 000 |
| Exhibit B | Notice of Intent to Demolish | 093 028 000 |
| Exhibit C | Notice of Intent to Demolish | 286 030 000 |
| Exhibit D | Notice of Intent to Demolish | 077 005 000 |
| Exhibit E | Letter – Tales of Cape Cod | Dated 02/20/18 |
| Exhibit F | Meeting Minutes | Dated 01/16/18 |