

MINUTES

**Barnstable Historical Commission
Town Hall
367 Main Street, Hyannis
Selectmen's Conference Room
November 15, 2016**

Laurie Young, Chair	Present
Nancy Clark, Vice Chair	Absent
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	Present
Nancy Shoemaker	Absent
George Jessop	Present
Ted Wurzburg	Present
Elizabeth Mumford	Present
Jo Anne Miller Buntich	Director, GMD
Marylou Fair	Admin Assistant, GMD

Chair Laurie Young called the meeting to order at 4:01pm

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

**Wenger, Robert & Bonnie, 523 Main Street, Centerville, Map 207, Parcel 049
Built c.1855-1875, Inventoried, Contributing Building in National Register Historic District
Partial Demolition of single-family dwelling for Addition**

Represented by Bonnie Wenger

Laurie Young explained that this application was sent over to the Cape Cod Commission for review due to its National Register listing, and she said the response from the Cape Cod Commission has significant impact on the homeowners' plans, with the loss of two proposed bedrooms. Chair Young suggested that the applicant may want to continue the application to confer with Sarah Korjeff at the Cape Cod Commission. George Jessop noted that the Cape Cod Commission suggested the addition be stepped back to preserve the shape and roof line. Mrs. Wenger replied that they prefer to work with the comments provided and had met with their architect over the weekend. Reviewing the comments and the side gable addition, George Jessop noted that integrating with the original means that the back corner gable would lap the rear corner and that the roof would be stepped down to show the rake board of the side gable. Beyond that, he felt the use of the existing materials and the new windows in the addition are appropriate, preserving the original structure and side porch. He suggested that an engaged column where the entry is closed would carry the line all the way back to the addition, although it may mean stepping back or bringing the porch out a little.

**Motion duly made by Elizabeth Mumford, seconded by George Jessop, to Continue the Notice of Intent Application to December 20, 2016, at 4:00pm.
So Voted Unanimously**

**Neidhardt, Steven & Daiva, Tree, Pond Street Realty, 30 Pond Street, Osterville, Map 118, Parcel 105
Built 1900, Inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District**

Full Demolition of single-family dwelling

Represented by Daiva Neidhardt

Laurie Young reported that she did make a site visit and did not find any **significant** architectural features. George Jessop concurred, calling the structure forgettable, with no architectural integrity.

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for full demolition proposed at 30 Pond Street, Osterville, that the Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved, Significant Building.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Ted Wurzburg, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the full demolition of the Building located at 30 Pond Street, Osterville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

So Voted Unanimously

Horwood, Richard, 131 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 066-001

Built c.1900, Inventoried, Contributing Building in National Register Historic District

Partial Demolition and Alteration of Garage

Represented by Mark Grenier, MG Design Build, Inc.

NOTE: Chair Young called this application as well as 133 Irving Avenue at the same time for the purposes of discussion

Elizabeth Mumford recused herself from the discussion as she is a direct abutter and left the room.

Commissioners reviewed the comments provided by Sarah Korjeff of the Cape Cod Commission and basically agreed that no character-defining features of these two structures would be significantly altered. George Jessop thought the curved roofline was unique, but Mark Grenier said it was most likely constructed in the early 1960s.

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds and determines, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 131 & 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, that:

- **The property is outside a local historic district;**
- **The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;**

The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed at 131 & 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, that the Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved, Significant Building.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the Building located 131 & 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, per plans submitted by MG Design Build, Inc., dated 10/17/2016, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town. The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds that the parts of the Significant Building to be retained are Preferably-preserved and shall not be demolished.

AYE: So Voted Unanimously

**Horwood, Richard, 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 066
Built c.1900, Inventoried, Contributing Building in National Register Historic District**

Partial Demolition and Alteration of Garage

NOTE: This application was called with the previous application and further discussion ensued.

George Jessop agreed with the Cape Cod Commission comments that the doors are an improvement, and he liked the windows in what is basically a shed. He noted that there is a slight increase in the height of the roof, but it does not decrease views from the building behind.

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds and determines, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 131 & 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, that:

- **The property is outside a local historic district;**
- **The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that would jeopardize the historic structure's status as a Contributing Structure in a National Register Historic District as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;**

The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed at 131 & 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, that the Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved, Significant Building.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the Building located 131 & 133 Irving Avenue, Hyannis, per plans submitted by MG Design Build, Inc., dated 10/17/2016, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town. The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds that the parts of the Significant Building to be retained are Preferably-preserved and shall not be demolished.

AYE: So Voted Unanimously

**Shea, Kevin & Blake, Kimberly, 19 Vine Avenue, Centerville, Map 226, Parcel 027
Built c.1900, Inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District**

Partial Demolition of single-family dwelling

Represented by Gordon Clark, Northside Design Assoc.

Mr. Clark detailed the project involving the construction of a dormer, removing the exterior staircases, fire escape and adding a new staircase at the entrance. Some windows will be retained, with some added to convert from a dormitory into a residential dwelling, with a first-floor addition also proposed. George Jessop noted that taking out the exterior staircases cleans it up immensely.

Chair Young opened Public Comment, and Lee Williams, President of the Cottage Association, said this property is right across the street from her. She called the house lovely, but in terrible need of restoration, saying this will enhance the neighborhood. Although she said she will lose some of her view, she favored the project.

Jim Lane, President of the Christian Camp Meeting Association, said this building was formerly owned by the Church and used as a place of respite for ministers, then recently merged into a Retreat Center. He said the new owners have been part of the Village and have great taste, and he supports the project.

Hearing no further comments, the Chair closed Public Comment.

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed at 19 Vine Avenue, Centerville, that the Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved, Significant Building.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

**Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the proposed partial demolition of the building located at 19 Vine Avenue, Centerville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.
So Voted Unanimously**

Continued Applications

Callahan, Richard, Trustee, Centerville Village Apartments Realty Trust, 981 Main Street, Osterville, Map 117, Parcel 026

Multiple Buildings Built 1924-1950, Inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District

Demolition of Service Station & Cottages, Relocation of Gas Station

Represented by Albert & Michael Schulz, Schulz & Schulz Law Offices

NOTE: This application was taken out of order and heard first.

Chair Young reminded the Commissioners of the history of this application, as the Commission had earlier found the buildings Preferably-preserved and imposed the 18-month demolition delay. Since that vote, she said 33 months have passed, and the initial decision expired.

Attorney Michael Schulz noted that their previous appearance nearly three years ago was right after the regulations changed from a six-month delay to an 18-month delay, making the Historical Commission the first stop in the regulatory process. He said the original proposal was to demolish all of the buildings on the site and construct 16 new units of housing, but, after listening to the comments provided here, the applicant now proposes to maintain the filling station, but seeks to raze the other three structures - the service/inspection station and two cottages - also reducing the number of new buildings from 16 to 9. Further, he said Bob Hayden inspected the service/inspection station but concluded that moving it would not be financially viable. George Jessop concurred with Bob Hayden's findings and felt the filling station (Building A) would be difficult to move, as well, but since it has been there for so long, it has become visual landmark of the village. Retaining it, he said, will provide an example to future generations of an active gasoline station.

Laurie Young opened the discussion to Public Comment, and John Crowell, President of the Osterville Village Association (OVA), stated that the Association has discussed this many times and several concerns still remain. He said members feel there is not enough information available at this time for what is proposed and asked the Commission to impose the 18-month delay. One main concern cited was that the buildings would be demolished before the new proposal is ready to proceed, leaving the village with a large empty lot. He also expressed concern for the loss of the historic buildings.

Bruce Cole, an abutter and OVA Director, submitted a letter for the record, appealing to the Commission to impose the 18-month delay due to the historical, architectural and cultural significance of the buildings. He reminded that the Commission previously voted that the buildings were Preferably-preserved and that vote should stand. He said it will take at least 18 months to get the other regulatory approvals that will be required, allowing time to incorporate these historic buildings into a new plan to preserve their charm and culture for the village.

Hearing no further comment, the Chair closed Public Comment.

Attorney Michael Schulz assured that no demolition will take place until they have all of the permitting approvals in place. George Jessop noted that the buildings are presently occupied, adding that Building B was constructed in a manner that makes moving it highly unlikely and re-using it as a residential structure also unlikely, and he felt the smaller structures are likely in need of complete gutting and re-wiring. Further, he said the character of the neighborhood has changed and, as far as development is concerned, increasing the density sometimes works to the benefit of the village in providing housing. Ted Wurzburg agreed with George Jessop's comments, calling them valid points.

George Jessop read the following findings into the record:

The Barnstable Historical Commission found, at their September 17, 2013, meeting, that the following structures at 981 Main Street, Osterville, Map 117, Parcel 026, as shown on draft Site Plan prepared by Sullivan Engineering, Inc. and CapeSurv dated September 24, 2013, were Significant and important to the setting of the neighborhood:

Mid-Way Gas Station identified as Building A

Service/Inspection Shop identified as Building B

Two-story Cottage/Office identified as Building C

One-story Cottage identified as Building E

And, further, that, based on materials submitted by the applicant, the Barnstable Historical Commission finds that:

- The applicant has demonstrated that the owner made a continuing, bona fide and reasonable effort to preserve, rehabilitate, and restore the subject buildings, and that such efforts have been unsuccessful;
- A demolition delay was imposed on November 19, 2013;
- And that 33 months have elapsed since that decision was filed with the Town Clerk.

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, that, in accordance with Section 112-3 G, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the demolition of the Preferably-preserved, Significant Buildings located at 981 Main Street, Osterville, as described in the findings, is detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage and resources of the Town. However, despite the evidence and materials submitted by the applicant demonstrating the preservation of Building A identified as the Mid-Way Gas Station, there is benefit in imposing an additional demolition delay for Buildings B, C & E.

AYE: Fifield

NAY: Young, Jessop, Wurzburg, Mumford

Johnson, Nancy, 137 Harbor Bluffs Road, Hyannis, Map 325, Parcel 119

Built 1928, Not Inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District

Partial Demolition of single-family dwelling

Represented by Willy Planinshek, Contractor

George Jessop, absent from the last meeting, submitted into the record a Confirmation of Evidential Review (Mullin Rule). Laurie Young reviewed Commission concerns that demolition has already occurred and new, inappropriate doghouse dormers have already been constructed. George Jessop noted that the new dormers provide for a nearly full second-story mass without raising the roof. For this reason, he said adding a gable into a gambrel-roof is not appropriate. He deemed the shed dormer appropriate, stretched to raise the eave height, but he questioned the inclusion of transoms over the windows. Mr. Planinshek explained that these are bedrooms that have wonderful views of the harbor, and he wanted to let light in. He also submitted photographs of surrounding dwellings that have doghouse dormers, noting gables are prevalent in the neighborhood. Laurie Young also found the doghouse dormers with sliders and the porches with cable wires inappropriate and asked Commissioners for their thoughts on any obvious resolutions. George Jessop felt that the porches on both the first and second stories would mitigate the shed dormers, but said he would rather see the sliders on the second floor higher rather than include the transoms, and he would prefer raising the header on the sliders. Further, he said the gable doghouse dormers are not compatible with the gambrel roof line. He added that he doesn't mind the sliders so much, but felt they should have gone higher, perhaps even a 7' slider, eliminating the incongruous transoms to provide more light than the existing slider and transom.

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Laurie Young, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application and revised plans to be submitted for the partial demolition proposed at 137 Harbor Bluffs Road, Hyannis, that the Significant Building is a Preferably-preserved, Significant Building.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Elizabeth Mumford, that, in accordance with Section 112-3F, the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the building located at 137 Harbor Bluffs Road, Hyannis, per revised plans to be submitted, should conform to these findings:

- **Shed roof proposal is preferred**
- **No transom windows on second floor sliders**
- **Existing windows are to be retained or replaced with 7' sliders on second floor**
- **Shed dormer plate should be dropped to within 8"-10" of existing door (fascia to be at least the casing length)**
- **Shed dormer should intersect with ridge below roof so that it is a new dormer**
- **Revised plans are to be reviewed by George Jessop, AIA**

AYE: So Voted Unanimously

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Ted Wurzburg, to adjourn the meeting at 6:06pm.

So Voted Unanimously

Respectfully submitted,
Marylou Fair, Recording Secretary
and Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield