

MINUTES

**Barnstable Historical Commission
Town Hall
367 Main Street, Hyannis
Selectmen's Conference Room
September 20, 2016**

Laurie Young, Chair	Present
Nancy Clark, Vice Chair	Absent
Marilyn Fifield, Clerk	Present
Nancy Shoemaker	Present
George Jessop	Present
Ted Wurzburg	Absent
Elizabeth Mumford	Absent
Jo Anne Miller Buntich	Director, GMD
Marylou Fair	Admin Assistant, GMD

Chair Laurie Young called the meeting to order at 4:08pm

Acting under the provisions of the Code of the Town of Barnstable, ss 112-1 through 112-7, the Historical Commission held a Public Hearing on the following applications previously determined significant and referred to Public Hearing:

1340 Main Street Osterville LLC, Named Buyer in a Purchase & Sales Agreement with Owner, EBEN, LLC, 1340 Main Street, Osterville, Map 119, Parcel 079

Built c.1761, Inventoried, National Register Individual Property

Partial Demolition (Foundation)

Represented by Attorneys Michael & Albert Schulz

Attorney Michael Schulz stated that there was an addition and a partial foundation constructed in 1997, but the main section has a crawl space and a Cape Cod cellar. He said they propose to stabilize the building and make a solid structure. Nancy Shoemaker commented that she is pleased they are paying attention to the structure, and Albert Schulz replied that it will be their future office. Chair Young referred to a memo from Sarah Korjef of the Cape Cod Commission that supports the project. Michael Schulz explained that the idea is to support the building and then excavate underneath, repair the wood between the building and the new foundation and add a new full cellar. He said windows will remain the same, but proposed maintenance includes painting and roof cleaning once the building is secure on the new foundation. Nancy Shoemaker asked that the dentil element in the trim be maintained. George Jessop noted that there are no gutters, and Michael Schulz stated that there are fir gutters on the front and this is one of the first things they will repair once the building is down, as they may not be installed properly.

Motion duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by George Jessop, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds and determines that, after review and consideration of the file and hearing testimony for 1340 Main Street, Osterville:

- **The property is outside a local historic district;**
- **The property is Individually Listed on the National Register of Historic Places;**
- **The actions proposed constitute a substantial alteration that could jeopardize the historic structure's National Register listing as defined in § 3 of the Cape Cod Commission Development of Regional Impact Review Threshold;**

The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds and determines that in exceeding these threshold criteria the project is subject to a mandatory referral to the Cape Cod Commission as a Development of Regional Impact.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by George Jessop, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for partial demolition proposed at 1340 Main Street, Osterville, the Significant Building is a Preferably Preserved Significant Building.

AYE: None

NAY: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by George Jessop, that in accordance with Section 112-3 F. the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition (i.e., foundation) of the Building located 1340 Main Street, Osterville, is not detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town. The Barnstable Historical Commission further finds that the parts of the Significant Building to be retained are Preferably Preserved and shall not be demolished.

AYE: So Voted Unanimously

**Falkenham, Lisa, 36 Magnolia Avenue, Centerville, Map 225, Parcel 012
Built 1920, Not Inventoried, Not in a National Register Historic District**

Partial Demolition and Additions

Represented by Doreve Nicholaeff & Alex Higgins, Nicholaeff Architecture + Design

Mr. Higgins stated that the house was built around 1920, with an existing two stories above-grade and one story below grade, and has been renovated many times, most recently in 2000 to add an entry portico and decks. He said there is not much left of the original house, and no significant details remain. The proposed addition is a new garage structure with living space above, as he said that, currently, the house is not easily accessible. They propose to reuse the trim and replicate it on the new addition, and he said they will meet existing roof lines and will not exceed the current height of the house. Chair Young noted that the west elevation is the major area of alteration, with the removal of the exterior wall. Chair Young then asked if anyone was present from the public and opened Public Comment.

Len Gobeil, a former member of this Commission, noted that although is no longer a member, he still reviews the Agendas, and his concern is with the size and scale of the addition, as he feels it will overwhelm the neighborhood. He noted that the Historical Commission may be the first board to review the project, and it may require other committees' review. He urged the Commission to impose an 18-month delay so that the applicant and residents may work together toward a goal that benefits all.

Wayne Kurker, an immediate abutter, stated that the location where the house sits is a beautiful one, and his concern is not enlarging the house, but the view most people see on the westerly side and the proposed massive addition that would be within 5 feet of the access right of way.

Laurie Young explained that the purview of this Commission involves not what is proposed, but what is to be removed. Hearing no further comment, the Chair closed Public Comment.

Nancy Shoemaker voiced concern that the existing west elevation is nearly completely gone. George Jessop looked at each of the elevations and said the elevation that is proposed to be altered appears to be the only portion of the house that is historic and scaled correctly, as all the other elevations seem to have been altered. Laurie Young concurred that it seems the demolition proposed would remove all the remaining historic features.

Doreve Nicholaeff inquired of the members how to accomplish what the owners want when you have to work with what you have. George Jessop suggested that this addition needs more of her special touches of composition, perhaps by incorporating some of the existing features. He said the original portion is nicely scaled, but will be eliminated.

Doreve Nicholaeff said that the simple shed dormer over the garage doors was designed to cut costs, and the owners are also considering additional plantings that would enhance the appearance.

Lisa Falkenham addressed the Commission, finding no historical aspect to the neighborhood and noting several houses in the neighborhood that had been demolished and/or extensively renovated over the years. Ms. Falkenham cited a full demolition approved for the house right next door. George Jessop explained that the Commission's concern is with the loss of what he referred to as the front elevation of this house, calling it very typical and perhaps one of the only remaining original features.

Craig Falkenham appreciated Mr. Jessop's perspective, but objected that the front elevation is not really what you see when you drive up the right of way. He said what you see is the north elevation that they are trying to soften. He said they have lived in the house for 16 years, and the garage is necessary to continue to live there. He said they do not wish to demolish the entire house, and he felt it is a mischaracterization to call this neighborhood historic. Doreve Nicholaeff explained that the thought was to make the alterations to the west elevation in order to soften the appearance of the north elevation which is what you see when you drive up.

The applicants took a moment to discuss their alternatives and, upon returning, asked the Commission to render their vote.

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Nancy Clark, that the Barnstable Historical Commission finds after review and consideration of public testimony, application, and record file for the partial demolition proposed at 36 Magnolia Avenue, Centerville, per plans prepared by Nicholaeff Architecture + Design dated 9/12/2016, that the Significant Building is a Preferably Preserved Significant Building.

AYE: So Voted Unanimously

Motion duly made by George Jessop, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, that in accordance with Section 112-3 G. the Barnstable Historical Commission determines that the partial demolition of the Preferably Preserved Significant Building located at 36 Magnolia Avenue, Centerville, per plans prepared by Nicholaeff Architecture + Design dated 9/12/2016, is detrimental to the historical, cultural, and architectural heritage or resources of the Town.

AYE: So Voted Unanimously to impose an 18-month Demolition Delay

Other Business

- 4 Washington Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 041
Receipt of Withdrawal of Application filed July 29, 2016

Motion duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by Laurie Young, to Accept the Notice of Withdrawal of the Application for 4 Washington Avenue, Hyannis, Map 287, Parcel 041

So Voted Unanimously

- Citizen outreach to rename Muddy Pond

David Martin, President of the Marstons Mills Historical Society, was present to ask the Commission for their support in renaming Muddy Pond, citing research indicating that the original name of the pond was Crocker Pond and then Hog Pond and finally Muddy Pond. He thought the Isaac Crocker Homestead which still sits nearby could account for the original name, and he reported that the Marstons Mills Village Association and the Marstons Mills Homestead Residents Association both support the new name. Nancy Shoemaker noted that the Crocker Homestead still stands, and the pond was originally named Crocker, so she would vote to support it. George Jessop and Marilyn Fifield agreed.

Motion duly made by Laurie Young, seconded by Nancy Shoemaker, to provide a letter of support to the Marstons Mills Homestead Residents Association.

So Voted Unanimously

With no further business before this Commission, a motion was duly made by Nancy Shoemaker, seconded by George Jessop, to adjourn the meeting at 5:30pm.

So Voted Unanimously

Respectfully submitted,
Marylou Fair, Recording Secretary
as edited by Commission Clerk Marilyn Fifield